# EXHIBIT C

## **Nina Perales**

From: Nina Perales

Sent: Friday, October 04, 2019 7:00 PM

**To:** 'Disher, Todd'

**Cc:** Glenn Moramarco; Robins, Jeffrey (CIV); Biggs, Adam; Ramon Soto

**Subject:** RE: DACA - Discovery

Todd.

Thanks very much for the confirmation.

We have carefully reviewed the documents that Plaintiffs produced this week in response to the subpoenas, as well as the documents provided to us at the depositions.

Although the produced documents describe processes related to Medicaid eligibility determinations by Alabama and Arkansas, they do not mention DACA.

Specifically, the documents to not respond to the requests for "[d]ocuments showing the types of data maintained by the [Alabama Medicaid Agency and Arkansas Department of Human Services] evidencing immigration and citizenship status of Medicaid applicants or beneficiaries." The documents also do not show "the types of data maintained by the [two state agencies] evidencing receipt of DACA by Medicaid applicants or beneficiaries." The documents also do not show when and how Alabama and Arkansas capture and store information showing that Medicaid applicants are recipients of DACA.

Although we understand your position that you have provided responsive documents and your request that we withdraw the motion to compel, we respectfully decline to do so because we do not believe the documents are responsive to the subpoenas duces tecum.

I will be in the office all day Monday and can discuss the matter further at your convenience. Thank you have and have a good weekend,

Nina Perales
Vice President of Litigation
Mexican American Legal Defense
and Educational Fund, Inc. (MALDEF)
110 Broadway, Suite 300
San Antonio, TX 78205
Ph (210) 224-5476 ext. 206
FAX (210 224-5382



CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §§2510-2521, covers this electronic message. This message and any attachment thereto contains CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION intended for the exclusive use of the named recipient(s) and may further be PRIVILEGED and CONFIDENTIAL attorney client communication, attorney work product or proprietary information. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any use, disclosure, dissemination, distribution, other than to return this message to the addressee(s), notification of its unintended disclosure, and the deletion of all copies is strictly prohibited and may be illegal. If you receive this communication in error, please notify the sender or the person who transmitted the communication immediately by

## Case 1:18-cv-00068 Document 434-3 Filed on 10/07/19 in TXSD Page 3 of 4

telephone at 210-224-5476 and/or by reply to this communication and delete this message. Persons responsible for delivering this communication to the intended recipient are admonished that this communication not be copied or disseminated except as directed by the intended recipient.

**From:** Disher, Todd [mailto:Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov]

Sent: Friday, October 04, 2019 12:29 PM

**To:** Nina Perales

Cc: Glenn Moramarco; Robins, Jeffrey (CIV); Biggs, Adam; Ramon Soto

Subject: Re: DACA - Discovery

Confirmed. Those are the correct ranges.

#### **Todd Lawrence Disher**

Trial Counsel for Civil Litigation
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
P.O. Box 12548 (MC 001)
Austin, TX 78711-2548
(512) 936-2266
Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov

On Oct 4, 2019, at 11:00 AM, Nina Perales <a href="mailto:nperales@maldef.org">nperales@maldef.org</a> wrote:

Todd,

Thank you for the email and the additional production. We were able to open the link on Tuesday morning and I'd like to verify with you that we accessed all the documents that you produced:

- 1. "AR Docs 2. pdf" containing Bates 764-1134
- 2. "AL Docs 2.pdf" containing Bates 713-763
- 3. "TX v. US DACA Joint Stip.docx"

Please let me know if these are all the documents you produced (with the full page ranges) and that there are no other documents in the encrypted message that may have needed special software to detect.

Many thanks,

Nina Perales
Vice President of Litigation
Mexican American Legal Defense
and Educational Fund, Inc. (MALDEF)
110 Broadway, Suite 300
San Antonio, TX 78205
Ph (210) 224-5476 ext. 206
FAX (210 224-5382

<image001.png>

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: The Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §§2510-2521, covers this electronic message. This message and any attachment thereto contains CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION intended for the exclusive use of the named recipient(s) and may further be PRIVILEGED and CONFIDENTIAL attorney client communication, attorney work product or proprietary information. If you are not an intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any use, disclosure, dissemination, distribution, other than to return this message to the addressee(s), notification of its unintended disclosure, and the deletion of all copies is strictly prohibited and may be illegal. If you receive this communication in error, please notify the sender or the person who transmitted the communication immediately by telephone at 210-224-5476 and/or by reply to this communication and delete this message. Persons responsible for delivering this communication to the intended recipient are admonished that this communication not be copied or disseminated except as directed by the intended recipient.

From: Disher, Todd [mailto:Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov]

Sent: Tuesday, October 01, 2019 5:32 PM

To: Nina Perales; Glenn Moramarco; Robins, Jeffrey (CIV)

Cc: Biggs, Adam

Subject: DACA - Discovery

I just sent all of you documents from Alabama and Arkansas. Please let me know if you do not receive the documents or have trouble accessing the files.

### **Todd Lawrence Disher**

Trial Counsel for Civil Litigation
Office of the Attorney General of Texas
P.O. Box 12548 (MC 001)
Austin, TX 78711-2548
(512) 936-2266
Todd.Disher@oag.texas.gov